



5th National Conference

Saturday & Sunday, 26 & 27 Jumada Oula 1440 H

February 2 & 3, 2019

Venue: Madina Center, Stockton, CA

Host: Islamic Shariah Council of California

Is Eid al-Adha Connected to 'Arafah?

An innovation of the 21st Century

Compiled by the Central Hilal Committee of North America
Presented by: Mawlana Zakaria Badat, Florida

An Innovation of the 21st Century

- SOME CLAIM:

Eid al-Adha is to be celebrated throughout the world on the day after the Hujjaj are in 'Arafah, regardless of the date according to moon sighting

What does the Shariah say about this?

1. The Legislation of Eid al-Adha and Hajj
2. View of the Four Mazhahib
3. Do Hajjis perform Eid al-Adha?
4. Does UNITY mean UNIFORMITY?

The Legislation of Eid al-Adha and Hajj

- Hajj is a pillar of Islam
- Hajj is a set of particular activities, in a particular place, in particular times, in particular days of Zhul Hijjah, with particular intention
- A main part of Hajj is 'Arafah

« الحج عرفة »

(أبو داود 1949، الترمذي 889)

The Legislation of Eid al-Adha and Hajj

- When the Prophet, peace and blessings upon Him, arrived in Madina, there were two special days that the people of Madinah celebrated (Nayruz and Mahrajan). He inquired, “What are these two days?”

The Legislation of Eid al-Adha and Hajj

- They said, “We used to celebrate them during the Days of Jahiliyyah.” The Messenger of Allah, peace and blessings upon Him, said:
- **“Allah has substituted for you two days better than them, The Day of Adha (sacrifice) and the Day of Fitr (breaking fast).**

(Abu Dawud, 1134)

The Legislation of Eid al-Adha and Hajj

- **In the 2nd year of Hijri**, after the Battle of Badr, the Prophet, peace be upon him, performed the first ever Eid al-Fitr.
- Thereafter, in Zhul-Hijjah, **he performed the first Eid al-Adha.** (Zarqani 1/454, 460)

The Legislation of Eid al-Adha and Hajj

- The Prophet ﷺ sent Abu Bakr (RA) in the **9th year of Hijri** to lead the people in Hajj. (Sirat al-Mustafa)
- The Prophet ﷺ went for Hajj the following year.
- Thus, they could not have performed Hajj before then, because Makkah was not conquered yet. **Hajj was legislated in the 9th year of Hijri.**

The Legislation of Eid al-Adha and Hajj

- If Eid came in 2 AH, and Hajj in 9 AH, and people claim that they must coincide at the same time, **how did they perform Eid without Hajj for 7 years?**
- There were no Hujjaj, no Arafah legislated on the Muslims before 9 AH
- How could anyone claim they must be performed on the same day?

The Legislation of Eid al-Adha and Hajj

أقام رسول الله صلى الله عليه وسلم بالمدينة عشر سنين يضحي

- The Messenger of Allah, peace and blessings be upon him, resided in Madinah for ten years and performed Ud'hiyyah. (Tirmizhi, Ahmad)
- He did this **without ever trying to see if the Hajjis were performing their Hajj at the same time as Eid al-Adha, although there were nine days from the beginning of Zhul Hijjah to the Eid day, allowing enough time to send someone to Makkah and find out**

The Legislation of Eid al-Adha and Hajj

- Eid – to be performed wherever we are
- Hajj – only in Makkah Mukarramah

2. View of the Four Mazhahib

- “No jurists [have] ever stressed that information be collected in order to celebrate Eid al-Adha according to Saudi dates.”
- None of the four Mazhahib have said that Eid must coincide with Hajj

History Of Moon Sighting In North America

ISNA's Position on Eid-ul-Adha

ISNA's Position on Eidul Adha Plainfield, IN.,

1/25/2002 (ISNA Headquarter) ::

For the last several years ISNA held the position that Eidul Adha is to be celebrated according to the announcement of Hajj and not according to our local moon sighting as we do for Ramadan and Eidul Fitr. But there were many scholars who criticized this position. They said that this position was not according to the Sunnah. Eidul Adha is to be on the 10th of Dhul Hijjah according to the moon sighting. Muslims in distant lands such as India, Pakistan, Indonesia, Central Asia, etc., have always been celebrating Eidul Adha according to their own moon sighting. There is no report that Muslims waited for the announcement of Hajj or made special effort to find out about the Day of Hajj in order to make their own announcements.

We checked the books of Fiqh, we did not find any support for the assertion that Eidul Adha decision should be made on the basis of Hajj decision. The Hadith of the Prophet - peace be upon him - that "al-Hajj yauma yahuju al-nas" is for those who make Hajj. Of course those who go to Hajj must go to 'Arafah according to the decision of the authorities there, even if that is contrary to the astronomical data or someone's own moon sighting. But people in far away lands do not make Hajj in their locations. They have to make Eid prayer and make Qurbani. They cannot have Eid on 9th of Dhul Hijjah, if the moon was not sighted in their location and sighted in Arabia one day before. They cannot have Udhhiyaha a day earlier.

ISNA's position was under strong criticism from the scholars. No Fiqh Scholar from any country came to the defense of ISNA's position. We have the North American Shura that brings major organizations together. ICNA and Imam Jamil al-Amin's group separated from us last Eidul Adha because of this position. We asked the 'Ulama in Saudi Arabia whether there was a special case for Eidul Adha. Do we have to celebrate Eidul Adha with the Hujjaj? Their answer was that there was no special case for Eidul Adha according to the Shari'ah. If you celebrate your Ramadan and Eidul Fitr according to your own sighting then also celebrate Eidul Adha according to your own sighting. However, if you decide to celebrate Ramadan and Eidul Fitr with Saudi Arabia, then you should also celebrate Eidul Adha with the Hujjaj. They told us that we must be consistent and should not play with this 'badah according to our own desires. There are only two positions recognized in Fiqh: Ittihad al-Matali' (if crescent is sighted in one locality, then all localities should follow it) or Ikhtilaf al-Matali' (each locality should see its own moon and decide according to its sighting). The 'Ulama' told us that we should adopt one position: either Ittihad al-Matali' or Ikhtilaf al-Matali'. We cannot have both or have one for Ramadan and Eidul Fitr and another for Eidul Adha. There is no basis for this inconsistency in the Shari'ah.

ISNA invited a conference on this subject on the weekend of November 18, 2000. Many scholars presented their papers and after long discussions we came to the decision to change our earlier position. This issue is purely religious and 'ibadah issue and is based on the understanding of Fiqh. If some trustworthy 'Ulama and Fuqaha' prove from the authentic sources of Shari'ah that our earlier position was correct, we shall go back to that position. We must follow what is right and should change ourselves when we know better. May Allah bless all of us to follow the rules of Allah. Wassalam.

Dr. Muzammil H. Siddiqi
President of ISNA

An Objection

- Some people claim that there was not enough time to connect the moon sightings in various areas of the Muslim Ummah in the past, but today we are much more advanced
- We can retrieve the information right away, so we should connect all of our Eid Salahs together!

The Response

- “It is not correct to say that it was not possible in those days for people living outside Saudi Arabia to know the exact date of Hajj, because this date is normally determined on the first night of Zhul-Hijjah. **There is a nine day period until Eid**, which is more than sufficient to acquire this information”

3. Do Hajjis perform Eid al-Adha?

- Do the Hujjaj perform Eid al-Adha?
- Do they even have the time to do so?
- Does anyone who performs Hajj pray Eid Salah on the 10th of Zhul Hijjah?

- ANSWER: NO

How do they substantiate this claim?

1. The Messenger of Allah, peace be upon him, explicitly stated the virtue of fasting on the Day of Arafah but he did not mention the 9th of Zhul Hijjah.
2. All regular fasts are based on moonsighting but the fast of Arafah is based on the day the Hujjah are in Arafah.

Why these proofs are NOT valid?

1. It is clearly stated in hadith that Rasulullah (s) fasted on the 9th of Zhul Hijjah (Abu Dawood, 2437).
2. It is clearly stated in hadith that the *ahkam* of Zhul Hijjah are based on moonsighting (Muslim, 1565).

4. Does UNITY mean UNIFORMITY?

- Some say: Unity is performing worship in the same exact way in the same exact time
- This is a logical fallacy. In practicality, impossible for everyone to pray at the same time
- Even if we scheduled everyone's Eid Salah on the same day, we would still be praying at different times

What are we focusing on?

- We are discussing Eid Salah, which is Wajib according to the Hanafi mazhab, and Sunnah according to others.
- **Jumuah is fard on all male, sane, able-bodied Muslims**
- **Millions of young Muslims miss Jumuah regularly due to school, work, etc.**

What are we focusing on?

- It is stated in Hadith, 'Whoever misses the Jumuah three times on account of negligence, then Allah will put a seal on his heart. (Tirmizhi, Abu Dawood)

Conclusion

- Arafah is connected to Muslims at Hajj
- Eid al-Adha is connected to Muslims in their respective localities
- Unity is on the Kalimah, not on physically performing religious observances at the same time