



# Is Eid al-Adha Connected to 'Arafah?

[www.hilalcommittee.org](http://www.hilalcommittee.org)



@CentralHilalCmt



# **A Claim of the 21<sup>st</sup> Century**

**Some say Eid al-Adha should be celebrated throughout the world on the day after the Hujjaj are in 'Arafah, regardless of the date according to moon sighting**

# **What does the Quran and Sunnah say about this?**

- 1. History of Eid al-Adha and Hajj**
- 2. Rulings from Fiqh and the Contemporary Scholars of Islam**
- 3. Do Hajjis perform Eid al-Adha?**
- 4. Does UNITY mean UNIFORMITY?**

# History of Eid al-Adha

When the Prophet, peace and blessings upon Him, arrived in Madina, there were two special days that the people of Madinah celebrated (Nayruz and Mahrajan). He inquired, “What are these two days?”

# History of Eid al-Adha

They said, “We used to celebrate them during the Days of Ignorance.” The Messenger of Allah, peace and blessings upon Him, said:

- **“Allah has substituted for you two days better than them, The Day of Adha (sacrifice) and the Day of Fitr (breaking fast).**

(Abu Dawud, 1134)

# History of Eid al-Adha

- **In the 2<sup>nd</sup> year of Hijri, after the Battle of Badr, the Prophet, peace be upon him, performed the first ever Eid al-Fitr.**
- **Thereafter, in Zhul-Hijjah, he performed the first Eid al-Adha.**  
(Zarqani 1/454, 460)

# History of Hajj in Islam

- Hajj was legislated in the 9<sup>th</sup> year of Hijri.
- The Prophet, peace and blessings be upon him, sent Abu Bakr, may Allah be pleased with him, in the 9th year of Hijri to lead the people in Hajj.
- The Prophet, peace and blessings be upon him, performed Hajj the following year.
- Hajj was not performed by Muslims in congregation before then, because Makkah was not conquered yet.

# History of Hajj in Islam

- If Eid started in 2 AH, and Hajj in 9 AH how did they perform Eid without Hajj for 7 years if they had to coincide at the same time?
- There were no Hujjaj, no Arafah legislated on the Muslims before 9 AH



# From Hadith

أقام رسول الله صلى الله عليه وسلم بالمدينة عشر سنين يضحي

- **The Messenger of Allah, peace and blessings be upon him, resided in Madinah for ten years and performed Ud'hiyyah. (Tirmizhi, Ahmad)**
- **He did this without ever trying to see if the Hajjis were performing their Hajj at the same time as Eid al-Adha, although there were nine days from the beginning of Zhul Hijjah to the Eid day, allowing enough time to send someone to Makkah and find out**

# Eid al-Adha and Hajj

- Eid – to be performed wherever we are
- Hajj – only in Makkah Mukarramah

# From Fiqh

- 1400+ years of Legal Precedence
- None of the Mazhahib Fiqh have ever said that Eid al-Adha must coincide with Hajj
- That is ijma': consensus of the Ummah

## Grand Mufti of Saudi Arabia: The date for Eid-ul-Adha is based on the moonsighting, not following Saudi Arabia

### Question:

I have a question about the dates of the Eids...I know that Eidul Fitr is after the month of Ramadhan and there is always dispute about this day (some will celebrate it after the 29th, while others celebrate it after the 30th), but in regards to the Eidal Adha, does this day coincide with what the hujjaj are doing in Makkah, or can this day differ according to the different countries others are in?

### Answer:

Praise be to Allaah.

The differences among Muslims with regard to Eid al-Fitr and Eid al-Adha is based on the difference of scholarly opinion, and it is the same for both Eids. **Shaykh Ibn Baaz, the Grand Mufti Saudi Arabia**, (may Allaah have mercy on him) said, after mentioning the difference of opinion among the scholars about different moon sighting in different countries at the beginning and end of the month:

It seems to me that the differences in moon sightings do not matter, and that what must be done is to follow the sighting of the moon with regard to starting and ending the fast and offering the sacrifice when it is proven according to sharee'ah that the moon has been sighted in any land.

Then he said: Whether or not we say that differences in sighting are valid, it seems that the ruling is the same for both Ramadaan and Eid al-Adha, and there is no difference between them according to what I know of sharee'ah. End quote. *Majmoo' Fataawa Ibn Baaz* (15/79).

In the fatwa of Shaykh Ibn 'Uthaymeen (may Allaah have mercy on him), it says that differences in moon sighting should be followed with regard to Eid al-Adha just as they are followed with regard to the beginning and end of Ramadaan.

Based on this, there is no problem if Eid al-Adha is on Friday in one country and on Saturday in another, and so on, based on the differences in moon sighting.

The same may be said with regard to the fast of Ramadaan, fasting the day of 'Arafah and fasting 'Ashoora', because these are things that have to do with the sighting of the moon, and the ruling on whether the month has begun or not.

And Allaah knows best.  
Dr. Muhammad Salih al-Munajjid

## **If countries differ with regard to when Ramadaan begins and when the day of 'Arafah is, with whom should I fast?**

### **Question:**

What if the day of 'Arafah is different because of the moon being sighted at different times in different countries? Should we fast according to the moon sighting in the country where we are or according to the moon sighting in al-Haramayn (the two Holy Sanctuaries)?

### **Answer:**

Praise be to Allaah.

This is based on a difference of opinion among the scholars: Is there only one moon sighting for the whole world or does it vary according to when the moon rises in different places?

The correct view is that it varies according to when the moon rises in different places. For example, if the moon is sighted in Makkah, and today is the ninth, and it is sighted elsewhere one day before Makkah, and the day of 'Arafah in Makkah is the tenth for them, it is not permissible for them to fast on this day because it is Eid. Similarly if it so happens that they sight the moon after Makkah, and the 9<sup>th</sup> in Makkah is the 8<sup>th</sup> for them, then they should fast the day that is the 9<sup>th</sup> for them, which is the 10<sup>th</sup> in Makkah. This is the correct view, because the Prophet (peace and blessings of Allaah be upon him) said: "When you see it (the new moon) fast and when you see it break your fast." Those who did not see the moon in their own location have not seen it. Just as people are unanimously agreed that the times for dawn and sunset vary according to their own location, so too the months are also worked out by location, just like the daily timings.

*Majmoo' al-Fataawa, 20.*

And Allaah knows best.

**Shaykh Ibn 'Uthaymeen**

**[One of the greatest scholars of Saudi Arabia]**

(may Allaah have mercy on him)

## Determination of Eid al-Adha

Justice Maulana Mufti M. Taqi Usmani

*[This article is included here for academic interest only. This year (1421 AH), The Shura Council of North America (which includes ISNA) has unanimously agreed to base Eid al-Adha determination on local moonsighting in North America. This welcome decision should end all controversy on this subject and bring about the same unity on Eid al-Adha that we have been witnessing on Ramadan and Eid-ul-Fitr.]*

*Historical Note: A few years ago Islamic Society Of North America (ISNA) had widely circulated a paper regarding determination of Eid al-Adha. It strongly suggested that all over the world Eid al-Adha determination should follow the announcement of Hajj dates in Saudi Arabia. Here is a scholarly evaluation of that claim by [Mufti Taqi Usmani.](#)]*

I have gone through the article of ISNA and with the utmost respect for their sentiment for Muslim unity, I am forced to say that the view expressed in the article (Eid al-Adha on next day of Arafat) is in total disagreement with the teachings of Quran and Sunnah, and with the Shari'ah position recognized throughout the centuries. This is an unprecedented view which has never been adopted by any of the Muslim jurists during the past 1400 years, and it has a number of intrinsic defects and anomalies, some of which are summarized here.

## ISNA's Position on Eid-ul-Adha

ISNA's Position on Eidul Adha Plainfield, IN.,

1/25/2002 (ISNA Headquarter) ::

For the last several years ISNA held the position that Eidul Adha is to be celebrated according to the announcement of Hajj and not according to our local moon sighting as we do for Ramadan and Eidul Fitr. But there were many scholars who criticized this position. They said that this position was not according to the Sunnah. Eidul Adha is to be on the 10th of Dhul Hijjah according to the moon sighting. Muslims in distant lands such as India, Pakistan, Indonesia, Central Asia, etc., have always been celebrating Eidul Adha according to their own moon sighting. There is no report that Muslims waited for the announcement of Hajj or made special effort to find out about the Day of Hajj in order to make their own announcements.

We checked the books of Fiqh, we did not find any support for the assertion that Eidul Adha decision should be made on the basis of Hajj decision. The Hadith of the Prophet - peace be upon him - that "al-Hajj yauma yahujju al-nas" is for those who make Hajj. Of course those who go to Hajj must go to 'Arafah according to the decision of the authorities there, even if that is contrary to the astronomical data or someone's own moon sighting. But people in far away lands do not make Hajj in their locations. They have to make Eid prayer and make Qurbani. They cannot have Eid on 9th of Dhul Hijjah, if the moon was not sighted in their location and sighted in Arabia one day before. They cannot have Udhhiyaha a day earlier.

ISNA's position was under strong criticism from the scholars. No Fiqh Scholar from any country came to the defense of ISNA's position. We have the North American Shura that brings major organizations together. ICNA and Imam Jamil al-Amin's group separated from us last Eidul Adha because of this position. We asked the 'Ulama in Saudi Arabia whether there was a special case for Eidul Adha. Do we have to celebrate Eidul Adha with the Hujjaj? Their answer was that there was no special case for Eidul Adha according to the Shari'ah. If you celebrate your Ramadan and Eidul Fitr according to your own sighting then also celebrate Eidul Adha according to your own sighting. However, if you decide to celebrate Ramadan and Eidul Fitr with Saudi Arabia, then you should also celebrate Eidul Adha with the Hujjaj. They told us that we must be consistent and should not play with this 'Ibadah according to our own desires. There are only two positions recognized in Fiqh: Ittihad al-Matali' (if crescent is sighted in one locality, then all localities should follow it) or Ikhtilafal-Matali' (each locality should see its own moon and decide according to its sighting). The 'Ulama' told us that we should adopt one position: either Ittihad al-Matali' or Ikhtilaf al-Matali.' We cannot have both or have one for Ramadan and Eidul Fitr and another for Eidul Adha. There is no basis for this inconsistency in the Shari'ah.

ISNA invited a conference on this subject on the weekend of November 18, 2000. Many scholars presented their papers and after long discussions we came to the decision to change our earlier position. This issue is purely religious and 'ibadah issue and is based on the understanding of Fiqh. If some trustworthy 'Ulama and Fuqaha' prove from the authentic sources of Shari'ah that our earlier position was correct, we shall go back to that position. We must follow what is right and should change ourselves when we know better. May Allah bless all of us to follow the rules of Allah. Wassalam.

Dr. Muzammil H. Siddiqi  
President of ISNA

# An Objection

- Some claim that there was not enough time to communicate the moon sightings in various areas of the Muslim Ummah in the past, but today we are much more advanced
- We can retrieve the information right away, so we should connect all of our Eid Salahs together!



# The Response

**“It is not correct to say that it was not possible in those days for people living outside Saudi Arabia to know the exact date of Hajj, because this date is normally determined on the first night of Zhul-Hijjah. There is a nine day period until Eid, which is more than sufficient to acquire this information”**

# Do Hujjaj perform Eid al-Adha?

- Do the Hujjaj perform Eid al-Adha?
- Do they have the time to do so?
- Does anyone who performs Hajj pray Eid Salah on the 10th of Zhul Hijjah?

**ANSWER: NO**

# More Proof

- It is clearly stated in Hadith that Rasulullah, peace and blessings be upon him, fasted on the 9<sup>th</sup> of Zhul Hijjah (Abu Dawood, 2437).
- It is clearly stated in hadith that the *ahkam* of Zhul Hijjah are based on moonsighting (Muslim, 1565).

# Does **UNITY** mean **UNIFORMITY**?

- Some say: Unity is performing worship in the same exact way in the same exact time
- This is a logical fallacy. In practicality, it is impossible for everyone to pray at the same time
- Even if we scheduled everyone's Eid Salah on the same day, we would still be praying at different times

# What are we focusing on?

- We are discussing Eid Salah, which is Wajib according to the Hanafi school, and Sunnah according to others.
- **Jumuah is fard on all male, sane, able-bodied Muslims**
- **Millions of young Muslims miss Jumuah regularly due to school, work, etc.**

# What are we focusing on?

It is stated in Hadith, 'Whoever misses the Jumu'ah three times on account of negligence, then Allah will put a seal on his heart.'

(Tirmizhi, Abu Dawood)

# Conclusion

- **Arafah is connected to Muslims at Hajj**
- **Eid al-Adha is connected to Muslims in their respective localities**
- **Unity is in our beliefs and values, not on physically performing religious observances at the same time**

# Take your part

- Visit [www.hilalcommittee.org](http://www.hilalcommittee.org),  
[@CentralHilalCmt](https://twitter.com/CentralHilalCmt) on X
- Sign up to receive updates about when and how to sight
- Contact [report@hilalcommittee.org](mailto:report@hilalcommittee.org) with shahadah information
- Spread the awareness, establish the Sunnah